

*Checklist
for review of the human resource
development component of
national plans to control tuberculosis*

Prepared by:

Karin Bergström

*Stop TB Department
World Health Organization
Geneva, Switzerland*

*With contributions from:
Jeffery Glassroth, ATS*
Wanda Walton, CDC, Atlanta*
Inge Pool, KNCV*
Jan Voskens, KNCV*
Susan Bacheller, USAID**

** Task Force Training of the Tuberculosis Coalition for Technical Assistance*



US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention



TUBERCULOSISFOUNDATION



This publication was partially funded by the Office of Health, Infectious Diseases and Nutrition, Bureau for Global Health, United States Agency for International Development, through the Tuberculosis Coalition for Technical Assistance, a cooperative agreement to accelerate implementation and expansion of the DOTS strategy in developing countries.

© World Health Organization 2005

All rights reserved.

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by World Health Organization to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either express or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use. The named authors alone are responsible for the views expressed in this publication.

Contents

1. <i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>1</i>
2. <i>Human resource (HR) development in the national TB control programme (NTP).....</i>	<i>2</i>
3. <i>Review organizational structure to manage HR development at national level of the NTP.....</i>	<i>3</i>
4. <i>Review overall direction of the plan for HR development for TB control.....</i>	<i>5</i>
5. <i>Review current situation</i>	<i>7</i>
6. <i>Review system for follow-up after training and links to overall TB control programme supervision within NTP</i>	<i>12</i>
7. <i>Review management and use of information for management of HR for TB control.....</i>	<i>13</i>
8. <i>Review short- and medium-term plans to strengthen teaching of TB control in basic training programmes for medical doctors, nurses and other categories of staff involved in TB control</i>	<i>15</i>
9. <i>Review management of finances</i>	<i>17</i>
10. <i>Review implementation and monitoring of the plan for HR development.</i>	<i>18</i>
11. <i>Review activities to evaluate implementation of the plan for HR development, and revise based on findings from monitoring and evaluation.....</i>	<i>20</i>
12. <i>Follow-up</i>	<i>22</i>

1. Introduction

Competent health-care providers and managers are critical to the successful implementation of the DOTS strategy to reach and sustain the targets for global tuberculosis (TB) control. The development and maintenance of a competent workforce for TB control is therefore a key component of the activities of national TB control programmes (NTPs).

For many years, NTPs have been implementing training activities for health-care workers and managers involved in TB control. However, as experience with the implementation of various training programmes has increased, so too has awareness of the need to pay additional attention to the quality of training, the need for better management of training programmes and the need for ongoing follow-up after training, staff rotation and staff turnover. The management of human resources for TB control therefore needs consolidation and strengthening.

The checklist described in this document has been developed as a tool to assist those involved in a systematic review of the human resource development component of the NTP. This component is often referred to as “training”. In this document, the term training is used in a broader context than the more traditional interpretation of the term, where training refers to organization and implementation of training courses. Training in this document is often replaced by the term “HR development” to stress the need for a broader and more long-term approach within NTPs.

The checklist is based on the content outlined in the WHO document, *Training for better TB control: human resource development for TB control – A strategic approach within country support* (WHO/CDS/TB/ 2002.301). It can be used in part or in total, depending on the purpose of the review. However, it is recommended that sections 2–4 are always included.

The checklist is structured in the form of questions to be answered and issues to be considered during the review process. It is strongly recommended that as much detail as possible is recorded to reflect the scope of item under review. Simple yes/no responses should be avoided. For some items, bullet points are included that cover issues to consider in guiding the user in responding. Users of the checklist with insufficient experience in HR management for TB control, including training and education, may be unable to assess all items to the level of detail indicated. If this is the case, it is recommended that a subject expert undertake an in-depth review of the HR component. However, the document can be used by a non-HR expert to identify gaps and areas for further review.

The layout of the checklist provides space for notes and observations. However, the size of this space is not an indication of the amount of information needed. The checklist should be adapted based on the purpose of the review.

If the document is used by an external consultant to the programme during a programme review or programme assessment, the person assigned the responsibilities of coordinating HR development in the NTP should be the key person answering the questions listed in the checklist. If this function is not assigned to a specific person, a key problem has already been identified at this stage in the review. The reviewer will subsequently have to obtain as much information as possible from various persons and sources.

For further information on conducting a comprehensive programme review, please refer to the WHO document, *Guidelines for conducting a review of a national tuberculosis programme* (WHO/TB/98.240).

2. Human resource (HR) development in the national TB control programme (NTP)

Item under review	Observations
<p>2.1 Is HR development, including training and education for TB control, a specific and clearly described component in the context of NTP programme implementation, improvement and expansion?</p> <p>Is it described as a separate component in the DOTS Expansion Plan?</p>	
<p>2.2 Are training and educational efforts planned and implemented in close collaboration and coordination with other programme strengthening efforts, such as the availability of drugs and a functioning laboratory network?</p>	

A key aspect of the role of the training coordinator is to plan training activities to occur alongside those related to drug supply, availability of registers, laboratory support structure including transport of sputum specimens and supervisors trained in DOTS strategy implementation, to enable the DOTS strategy to be implemented.

3. Review organizational structure to manage HR development at national level of the NTP

Item under review	Observations
<p>3.1 Is there a designated person, within the NTP, to coordinate all HR development activities?</p> <p>If yes, is this person solely responsible for this activity or is coordination of HR development only one of many responsibilities?</p>	
<p>3.2 Is there a training coordination group with representatives from training institutions, field staff, professional organizations and other disease control programmes such as HIV/AIDS?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess whether:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the group has specific terms of reference (TOR); • the group is small enough to enable constructive work; • there are clear, relevant selection criteria for members; • the functional arrangements are specified e.g. meeting frequency, which will enable the group to fulfil the TOR. 	

Item under review	Observations
<p>3.3 Are there clearly specified and assigned roles and functions for management training at sub national levels (regional/provincial, district) and are assigned staff trained for these functions?</p> <p>Note: This question refers to the responsibilities at district/regional/state level for the organization of training activities; follow-up after training and identification of new staff that need training as a result of staff turnover. Questions related to roles and functions of service delivery staff are addressed in question 5.1 below.</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • job descriptions for management training; • how functions have been assigned; • how assigned staff have been trained to perform these functions; • whether national/regional training institutions are actively involved. 	

4. Review overall direction of the plan for HR development for TB control

Item under review	Observations
4.1. Are there clear medium- and long-term goals for national HR development for TB control?	

Consider the following as a basis for the review of item 4.1:

The long-term goal for HR development for TB control is to reach and sustain a situation whereby:

Staff at different levels of the health system have the skills, knowledge and attitudes (i.e. competencies) necessary to successfully implement and sustain TB control activities, including the implementation of new and revised strategies and tools, and in relation to HIV management, and that there are sufficient numbers of staff of all categories for programme implementation.

Item under review	Observations
4.2 Are there clear, comprehensive strategies to reach the goals as described in item 4.1 above?	

Consider the following as a basis for the review of item 4.2:

- The strategy, describing how to reach the goal, should include at least the following components:
- ◆ establish/improve existing in-service training programmes for TB control;
 - ◆ establish/improve existing systems and structures to identify performance deficiencies related to lack of skills and to enable staff to acquire the necessary competencies for TB control activities through formal or on-the-job training (supervision and follow-up);
 - ◆ establish/improve existing systems to, on an ongoing basis, identify new staff working in TB control and enable them to participate in the appropriate training programmes as soon as they take up a new position (staff rotation);
 - ◆ review and revise as necessary basic training programmes for medical doctors, nurses and other health-care workers involved in the implementation of TB control activities, to ensure that new graduates are fully prepared for work in TB control;
 - ◆ coordinate training related to TB control with training for other disease control interventions such as for HIV/AIDS prevention and control;
 - ◆ coordinate with relevant departments to ensure adequate deployment and retention of staff.

5. Review current situation

Item under review	Observations
<p>5.1 Are job descriptions for staff involved in TB control up to date to correspond with current policies and recommendations for TB control, distributed and known to all staff concerned?</p> <p>List the categories of staff involved and review separately.</p>	

Item under review	Observations
<p>5.2 Review current training programmes for different categories of health-care staff involved in the TB programme according to their functions. Determine whether the training programmes provide participants with the necessary knowledge, skills and attitudes related to their functions in TB control.</p> <p>List the training programmes/courses and review/assess separately:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the overall objective of the course; • are the course objectives directly related to job descriptions? • are there specific measurable learning objectives for the course and are they directly related to job descriptions? • do training methodologies and techniques enable the participants to develop the skills based on the learning objectives? • is there enough time allocated to different parts of the course to meet the learning objectives? • is evaluation of course participants (reaction and learning evaluation) included? • pass/fail – is there a system to support participants who do not meet minimum standards? 	

Item under review	Observations
<p>5.3 Review training material for all categories of staff training. List all material and review separately.</p> <p>Determine whether the NTP training material used is up to date, based on participatory teaching methodologies, corresponds to the learning objectives and is based on skills development.</p> <p>List the training programmes/courses and review/assess separately:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • is the NTP using generic training material? If yes, has the material been adapted? • if the material has been developed locally, is it developed based on a task analysis for the specific job? • is the material developed based on participatory teaching and learning methodologies? • is the material up to date (reflects the implementation of the DOTS strategy) and technically correct? 	

Item under review	Observations
<p>5.4 Review selection and training of course facilitators for the different training programmes. Determine whether the current selection of course facilitators is optimal to ensure quality and sustainability of training activities.</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • how training institutions are involved in in-service training; • if there is a pool of course facilitators for different training courses; • if/how the facilitators have been trained in educational methodologies and facilitator skills; • if/how the facilitators have been trained in different aspects of TB programme management; • if/how the facilitators have been trained in how to evaluate course participants; • if/how the facilitators have been trained in course management. 	

Item under review	Observations
<p>5.5 Review organization of training courses (short- and long-term plans). Determine whether the current organization of courses addresses all needs for capacity building for TB control and whether organization is realistic.</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ongoing in-service training for staff not previously involved in the programme (in new areas for DOTS expansion); • training of new staff (as a result of staff turnover); • refresher training and updating of programme staff; • training to remedy performance deficiencies identified during supervision; • training schedules – when courses are organized and coordination with other programme activities; • number of courses organized over a defined period of time; • how resource requirement are assessed; • how logistics are arranged. 	

6. Review system for follow-up after training and links to overall supervision within NTP

Item under review	Observations
<p>6.1 Review the organizational structure for follow-up after training. Is a system in place for follow-up after training?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • how is follow-up after training organized? • who is responsible? • how is follow-up conducted? • how is information from follow-up communicated back into the training system? • how is training follow-up linked and coordinated with regular programme supervision? 	
<p>6.2 Are supervisors trained for follow-up after training?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the roles and responsibilities of staff conducting follow-up after training; • whether specific courses on how to do follow-up after training are organized. 	

7. Review management and use of information for management of HR for TB control

Item under review	Observations
<p>7.1 Are information needs clearly determined? Determine whether information is available in a timely manner and whether it is used for decision-making regarding training.</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • how are decisions and priorities made based on essential information (functions of personnel, when trained, when due for continued training, etc., identification of new staff)? • how is new staff (as a result of staff turnover) identified in districts where DOTS training has already taken place? 	

Item under review	Observations
<p>7.2 Assess existing data management procedures. Determine whether the procedures are functioning and providing the essential information for optimal planning and management of training activities.</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • who is using different types of information (district coordinators, national managers); • current forms and procedures for collecting, recording, tabulating and analysing data for training management and whether they meet training management needs. 	

8. Review short- and medium-term plans to strengthen teaching of TB control in basic training programmes for medical doctors, nurses and other categories of staff involved in TB control

Item under review	Observations
<p>8.1 Is there a working group for strengthening the TB control component in basic training curricula for medical doctors, nurses and other categories of staff involved in TB control?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the TOR for the working group; • the members of the working group; • the criteria for the selection of the members; • how the chairpersons and secretary are selected; • the functional arrangements (frequency of meetings, provision for extraordinary meetings, etc.). 	

Item under review	Observations
<p>8.2 Review current situation and determine whether the current curricula (referred to in item 8.1 above) are addressing the needs for curriculum strengthening including teaching/learning material and additional training of faculty.</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the relevance of the curricula (content and methodologies) to the needs for DOTS implementation; • the relevance of teaching/learning material; • the relevance of the teacher training; • linkages to overall curriculum development activities. 	
<p>8.3 Are there short- and medium-term plans to strengthen the teaching of TB control in basic training programmes for medical doctors, nurses and other categories of staff involved in TB control?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • if objectives are specific, measurable, attainable, realistic, and time bound (SMART) and the linkages between objectives and strategies clear and logical; • the schedule of activities and resource requirements the assignment of responsibilities. 	

9. Review management of finances

The questions related to management of finances in this section only represent a brief overview and are not intended to replace a comprehensive review of the programme's financial management.

Item under review	Observations
<p>9.1 Is there a specific budget for the training component/is the training component clearly identifiable in the overall NTP budget?</p>	
<p>9.2 Is there a clear system for financial monitoring and reporting used for decision-making?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the financial planning and monitoring cycle; • existing mechanisms for financial control; • the financial reporting – institutional and donor requirements. 	

10. Review implementation and monitoring of the plan for HR development

Item under review	Observations
<p>10.1 Review the timeliness of implementation of activities. Are activities in the plans for HR development implemented in a timely manner?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the preparation and use of annual work plans; • the use of Gantt charts; • coordination of activities. 	
<p>10.2 Review deployment of HR. Are HR deployed according to determined needs and are all manpower needs met? Determine whether there are sufficient staff at all levels to implement the DOTS strategy and reach the global targets for TB control?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the staffing at central level; • the staffing at provincial and district level; • the staffing at peripheral level; • coordination with HR department of ministry of health to solve problems with staff vacancies and long-term needs for additional staff. 	

Item under review	Observations
<p>10.3 Review timeliness of allocation of resources (excluding HR; see item 10.2). Are resources allocated in a timely manner according to plans?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • cash flows; • distribution of training/learning materials. 	
<p>10.4 Review regular supervision and follow-up after training. Are activities implemented according to plans?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • follow-up after training versus regular programme supervision. 	

11. Review activities to evaluate implementation of the plan for HR development, and revise based on findings from monitoring and evaluation

Item under review	Observations
<p>11.1 Is the training and education plan evaluated on a regular basis? (This section relates to the quality of the plan.)</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • whether the goals and objectives of the plan are appropriate; • whether the planned activities were the most appropriate related to needs. 	
<p>11.2 Is the training process evaluated on a regular basis?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • whether activities were implemented as planned; • the process of training and education, whether the training curricula were implemented as planned using the planned teaching methodologies, materials and evaluation methods. 	

Item under review	Observations
<p>11.3 Are training products (course participants) evaluated?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the evaluation methods chosen are appropriate in relation to the measurable learning objectives; • performance testing methods including the use of pass/fail criteria. 	
<p>11.4 Are training plans revised according to findings from monitoring and evaluation?</p> <p>When reviewing this item assess:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • when and on what basis plans are revised; • the process of revision; • when, on what basis and how methods for student evaluation are modified. 	

12. Follow-up

The final stage of the review is follow-up. It is important that this stage is carefully planned and that deadlines are set for the implementation of follow-up activities.

The review report should be finalized and recommendations approved for the relevant authorities. The NTP manager and the TB Training Coordinator are subsequently responsible for implementation of the recommendations. This process should be viewed as an event in the dynamic process of change. The plan for HR development for TB control should be periodically reviewed and updated based on needs and experiences in implementation. The cycle of this dynamic process is planning, implementation, monitoring, evaluation and replanning.